Performance Assessment: Requirements and Evidence to Support the Use of Simulation:

David J Murray MD
Carol B. and Jerome T. Loeb
Professor of Medicine
Director, Howard and Joyce
Wood Simulation Center
Washington University School
of Medicine
Anesthesiologist-in-Chief
St Louis Children’s Hospital,
St Louis, MO

Towards Safer Patient Care: Measuring the Efficacy of Simulation Training

- Simulation Training ➔ Professional skill
- Professional skill ➔ Clinical Performance
- Clinical Performance ➔ Practice Improvement
- Practice Improvement ➔ Practice Standards
- Practice Standards ➔ Patient Safety

Simulation assessment: current and future approaches to evaluating performance

- Psychomotor Skills
- Clinical Judgments (Recognition, Diagnosis and Treatment)
- Communication and Teamwork Skills

Psychomotor Skill Acquisition

A central venous line training program reduced retained guide wires, arterial puncture and pneumothorax.

Are Bad Outcomes From Questionable Clinical Decisions Preventable Medical Errors? A Case of Cascade Iatrogenesis

- Priorities for enhancing safety:
  - Recognize that not all errors are “system errors”
  - More emphasis on research rather than initiatives and isolated case analysis
  - Investigate cognitive and procedural errors
  - Foster individual skills and expertise
  - Increase physician responsibility and accountability


Priorities for enhancing safety:

- More emphasis on research rather than initiatives and isolated case analysis
- Investigate cognitive and procedural errors
- Foster individual skills and expertise
- Increase physician responsibility and accountability

Patient Safety Implications: Failure Mode and Effects Analysis (FMEA)

- Failure Mode and Effects Analysis (FMEA) to identify high-priority failure modes
  - Recognizes that it is impossible to eliminate all failures
  - Training directed to reduce the frequency, decreasing the severity, and improves the detection of failures before failure leads to harm.

Performance in Practice: Simulation and Task Training

- What preparation is appropriate prior to conducting a supervised procedure?
- What are the steps required to effectively accomplish each procedure?
- Are there technical milestones that could be measured for each step?
- Are there common misadventures in performing this procedure?
- Can these errors be programmed in a simulated environment?
- What is the range of resident skill prior to and following simulation training?
- Can the 'learning curve' be predicted from simulation training?
- How many ‘mentored’ or training procedures are needed before a trainee possesses the expertise to function independently?
- In order to meet minimum qualifications, how many procedures are needed?
- How many procedures are needed to maintain requisite skill?

Simulation-Based Assessment: Why Score? Curriculum Quality

- Scores require faculty to define expectations and commit to the required and essential clinical management
- Participants’ scores used to analyze quality of scenarios (difficulty, content, construct and scoring)
- Ability measure provide curriculum affirmation (or reproof) (Validation)
- Potential to direct curriculum effort to performance deficits, the need for an adaptive curriculum
- Individual score assures feedback directed to strengths and weaknesses
- Motivation to acquire and exceed performance expectations (the secondary learning outcome)

Simulation-Based Assessment: Why Score? Goal-Directed Learning

- Secondary Outcomes
  - Motivate Learning Goals
  - USMLE Clinical Skills Examination and Medical Student Learning
  - Assessment drives learning

Simulation-based Assessment: Scenarios in Acute Care (Clinical Judgment, Decision-making, Communication)

- Acute-care events are often associated with an adverse patient outcome, so improving this practice domain will result in increased patient safety
- Borderline trainees frequently manifest skill deficits in performing a logical, sequential and timely patient evaluation
- Compressed timeline of a ‘crisis’ offers an opportunity to study skills and behaviors

Simulation-based Assessment: Acute Events

- A specialist’s advanced skills in patient care management (judgment, communication, teamwork) might not be evident in routine practice.
- Deficits in these essential skill sets are often difficult to recognize and more difficult to remediate
- Simulation offers a method to assess these skills
Simulation-based Curriculum: Problem-based (scenario or events)

Common Skill Deficits:
- setting priorities,
- generating hypothesis,
- processing knowledge,
- assigning probabilities,
- recognizing important, from unimportant information,
- integrating competing issues,
- recognizing limits,
- learning when to call for assistance

The transition out of medical school—a qualitative study of descriptions of borderline trainee interns.
Wilkinson TJ, Harris P. Medical Education 2002; 36: 466-72

Building the Simulation Assessment

Define the Skills, Choose the Appropriate Tasks, Develop the Scenarios

Design Scoring Methods, Train Raters, Pilot Scenarios

Enroll Participants and Score Performances

Analyze Scores to Determine Quality of Scenarios (Discrimination, Difficulty) and Rater Reliability

Gather Evidence about Validity of the Scores: Correlation with Experience, Training and Practice

Defining the Skills and Choosing the Appropriate Simulation Tasks

Scenario is the fundamental building block of the simulation-based assessment.
- Selecting competence domains that are amenable to a simulation environment,
- Defining the expected skills that are needed to diagnose and manage the crisis
- Designing a scenario that has the skills required embedded into the framework
- Establish instruments and metrics to conduct the assessment

Malignant Hyperthermia

- Heart rate increases, unresponsive to intervention,
- Arrhythmia, T wave changes (K+ 6.8 meq),
- Progressive CO2 and tachycardia throughout (e.g. scenario 3 minutes)
- Key Scoring: Recognition of MH and Declaration of Emergency

Hyperkalemia

58 year old, 55 kg, diabetic, for fem-pop bypass [Retinopathy and Nephropathy (Cr=2.3 mg)]
Cross-Clamp removed 20 minutes ago
BP and HR elevated; Arrhythmia, peaked T wave,
K+ to 7.4 meq, BP declines

Scoring Issues in Performance Assessment

- Choice of method
- Choice of person to score
- Cost, efficiency, availability
- Experts and Consensus on Scoring
- What to score
- Discreet actions
- Speed, Accuracy, Skill, Sequence, Degree of Difficulty
- When to score
- Real-time, audio-video recording
Analysis of Participant Scores

Objective versus Qualitative Scoring

Scoring is not random ... we hope....
- Can vary as a function of
  - Interpretation
  - Portrayal
  - Favoritism
  - Memory
  - Confusion
  - Other factors
  - Etc.

Participant Scores: Analysis of Scenarios, Raters and Scoring Systems
- Reliability of Participant Scores (Participant Ability)
- Factors that influence the ability measure
  - Raters (Definition and Interpretation, Bias, Attention)
  - Content of the exercise (Subject, Design, Construct)
  - Scoring system used to measure skill
- An Analysis of Sources of Variance Results in a Reliability Measure

Analysis of Participant Scores: Raters
- For each participant/scenario combination, what is the range of scores among the raters?
- Do raters agree on the rank order of participants?
- Do raters differ in overall stringency?
- Are raters consistent on the overall score?
- Do raters define success and failure similarly specific scoring items?
- Are there specific action items that alter the overall score? (‘the lethal action/omission/commission’)

Scoring Analysis: Quality of Assessment
- Analysis of participant scores can reveal test flaws:
  - Scenario ineffective model of clinical event
  - Scoring system does not captures key elements of performance
  - Raters criteria or interpretation bias
Analysis of Participant Scores: Scenarios

- What are the range of scores for each scenario?
- Are some scenarios too easy? Are some scenarios too difficult?
- Are there any scenarios, that negatively correlate with performance on other scenarios?
- Is there a scenario that less experienced trainees do better than more experienced trainees?
- What is the correlation of performance across the scenarios? Is it a positive correlation?
- Is there a specific scoring item that correlates with the overall participants scenario score?
- Is there scoring items that do not differentiate final score?

Scenario Score Variance: Rationale for the Multiple Scenario Assessment

Simulation-based Assessment for Anesthesia Equipment Failure


Simulation-Based Assessment of Pediatric Anesthesia Skills

James J. Fehr, MD, FAAP, John R. Boulet PhD, William B. Waldrop MD, Rebecca Snider, MHS, Megan Brockel, MD, Michael Bayles, MD, Anesthesiology 2011; 115: 1308-15.
Simulation as a method to develop prospective practice guidelines

  - "knowledge of the outcome of an adverse event influences their thinking and assessment of the event."
  - "fondness for retrospective techniques (such as morbidity and mortality conferences, malpractice claims analysis, error reporting systems, chart reviews) for investigating adverse events that harm patients."

Quality of Care, Performance Assessment and Expert Opinion

  - 112 anesthesiologists were presented with identical clinical scenarios but differing outcomes.
  - Reviewers were more likely to judge anesthesia care as appropriate if the injury was temporary; conversely, reviewers were more likely to judge anesthesia care as substandard or impossible to judge if the injury was permanent.

Simulation-derived algorithm: A better method to achieve a performance consensus

- Expectations based on overall goals and considerations rather than avoiding a single retrospective adverse outcome
- A prospective simulation approach develops an algorithm with attention to timing and sequence of each step in a 'real time' simulation environment.
- If experts are required to participate in managing the algorithm
- Inordinately high performance expectations can be modulated
- Scoring based on what expert actually 'does'
Performance Assessment: Requirements and Evidence to Support the Use of Simulation

- Evidence of Simulation’s Efficacy in Patient Safety
  - Psychomotor Skills, Simulation Drills
- Simulation: Patient Safety and Medical Misadventure (Error)
  - Cognitive Skills, Judgment, Communication and Teamwork Skill
- Practical Simulation Assessment
  - Scenario, Scenario Content, Design and Number
  - Scoring and Performance Assessment
  - Reliability and Validity
  - Setting Performance Standards